# Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Institute Body held on 22<sup>nd</sup> December, 2020 in E-classroom of Administrative Block at AIIMS, Patna.

The following members were present during the meeting.

1) Dr. N. K. Arora	President
Executive Director	(online)
International Clinical Epidemiology Network (INCLEN)	
New Delhi	

2)	Prof. Devi Prasad Tiwari	 Member
	Vice Chancellor	
	Veer Kunwar Singh University	
	Ara (Bihar)	

3)	Shri Dharmendra S. Gangwar	 Member (ex-officio)
	Additional Secretary & Financial Advisor	(online)
	Govt of India	

4) Prof. Vijaylakshmi Saxena	20 Mg	Member
General President		(online)
Indian Science Congress Association		

5)	Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay	 Member
	Senior Director and Head	
	Gastroenterology and Hepatology	
	Max Super Speciality Hospital, New Delhi	

6)	Dr. Vishwambhar Singh	 Member
	Associate Professor	
	Department of ENT, IMS, BHU, Varanasi	

Member

7) Dr. Rajiva Kumar Singh

Professor, Department of Physiology

	Patna Medical College, Patna		
8)	Dr. Surya Kant	e4 42	Member
	Professor and HoD		
	Department of Respiratory Medicine		
	King George Medical University, Lucknow		

9)	Dr. Subrata Sinha	 Member
,	Professor & HoD	
	Department of Biochemistry	
	AIIMS New Delhi	

Marie

#### 10) Shri Sanjay Jaiswal

Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha)

-- Member

#### 11) Shri Chhedi Paswan

Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha)

-- Member

#### 12) Dr. P. K. Singh

Director, AIIMS Patna

-- Member Secretary

#### **Special Invitee:**

#### 1. Umesh Kumar Bhadani

Dean, AIIMS Patna

#### 2. Shri Nilambuj Sharan

Joint Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare

#### 3. Shri Parimal Sinha

Deputy Director (Admin.), AIIMS Patna

#### Leave of absence granted to:

#### 1. Shri Ram Chandra Prasad Singh

Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Rajya Sabha)

#### 2. Prof. Pramod Kumar Jain

Director, IIT Patna

#### 3. Shri Deepak Kumar

Chief Secretary, Govt. of Bihar

#### 4. Dr. Manohar Agnani

Additional Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare

Miter

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/01/2020:

**Dr. P. K. Singh**, *Director*, *AIIMS Patna* at the start of the meeting welcomed the president of the Institute Body as well as other distinguished members for the 5<sup>th</sup> Institute Body meeting on his personal behalf as well as on behalf of AIIMS, Patna.

AIIMS, Patna is privileged to welcome **Dr. N. K. Arora**, *President of Institute Body* and all members of the Institute Body for its fifth meeting.

**Dr. N. K. Arora**, *President of the Institute Body* welcomed all the new members of the *Institute Body*. Referring to the <u>disruption being</u> faced by the country and the way it has been responded to it, he said that a lot of good things have also happened during these difficult and also paved the way for many opportunities. He said unfortunately, the Members are not able to meet physically but hoped very soon that will be possible.

All the members present including members who were online and special representatives introduced themselves.

We would like to convey our sincere thanks for sparing valuable time for attending the 5th meeting of the Institute Body of AIIMS, Patna and extending their guidance for all-round development of this Institute.

Mutura

Way .

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/02/2020:

Approval of the Minutes of the Meeting of 4<sup>th</sup> Institute Body Meeting on held on 30<sup>th</sup> September 2020.

The minutes of the meeting was circulated to all the members. Any amendment/comment/modification to it may be discussed/deliberated upon before its final acceptance.

#### Discussion:

Minutes were circulated and no comments were received.

**Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal**, Hon'ble Member of Parliament raised that this issue is still pending for the Institute Body to discuss, he said that he thinks the whole issue should be referred to the Central Vigilance Commission which will fix the responsibility, why it took 6 years to get it decided, and let CVC decide what is right and wrong and who are the people responsible for this whole issue. He said if something has been done wrong then it should be decided who is responsible for the financial loses which has happened to Government exchequer.

**Dr. N. K. Arora**, *President Institute Body* informed the Hon'ble Member that this is going to be a full agenda item subsequently.

#### Decision:

Minutes of the meeting of the 4<sup>th</sup> Institute Body Meeting is approved.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/03/2020:

The Section – 10 (1) of the AIIMS Act, 1956 provides that "there shall be a Governing Body of the Institute, which shall be constituted by the Institute from among its Members in such manner as may be prescribed by regulations. Annexure-I (Pg. 3-4)

The AIIMS Regulations, 2019 under Para – 5 has provided the constitution of the Governing Body. **Annexure-II (Pg. 2-3)** 

The composition of the Governing Body is as under:-

(a) President of the Institute - Chairman

(b) DGHS - Ex-officio member

(c) Representative of the - Ex-officio Member Ministry of Finance

(d) Director, AIIMS Patna - Member Secretary

- (e) One member elected by the members of the Member Institute Body amongst the three members of Parliament elected to the Institute.
- (f) Six members to be elected by the members Member of the Institute from amongst themselves.
- (g) Permanent Special Invitees:
  - (i) Additional Secretary (in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in charge of the Institute);
  - (ii) Joint Secretary (in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in charge of the Institute);
  - (iii) Dean (Academics);
  - (iv) Deputy Director (Administration); and
  - (v) Senior Financial Advisor

As per (e) above, the Members of the Parliament elected to the Institute are as below:-

- (i) Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal, Member of Parliament, Hon'ble MP, Lok Sabha
- (ii) Shri Chhedi Paswan, Member of Parliament, Hon'ble MP, Lok Sabha
- (iii) Shri Ram Chandra Prasad Singh, Hon'ble MP, Rajya Sabha

The constitution of the Institute Body of AIIMS Patna has been notified vide notification dated 12.08.2020. **Annexure-III** 

A form was circulated to all the members of the Institute Body for election of 1 (one) member of the Parliament and for election for 6 (six) members among the members of the Institute Body **Annexure IV** for constitution of Governing Body of AIIMS Patna. The members were requested to give their preference of names for election of names to the Governing Body:

Mint way

Mich .

Responses were received from the following members:

- (i) Shri Ram Chandra Prasad Singh, Hon'ble MP, Rajya Sabha
- (ii) Shri Chhedi Paswan, Member of Parliament, Hon'ble MP, Lok Sabha
- (iii) Shri Sunil Kumar, Director General of Health Services, MoHFW, GoI, (Ex officio)
- (iv) Prof. Devi Prasad Tiwari, Vice Chancellor, Veer Kunwar Singh University, Ara, Bihar
- (v) Shri Deepak Kumar, Chief Secretary (Ex-officio)
- (vi) Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay, Senior Director and Head, Gastroenterology and Hepatology, Max Super Speciality Hospital, New Delhi.
- (vii) Dr. Vishwambhar Singh, Associate Professor, Department of ENT, IMS, BHU, Varanasi.
- (viii) Dr. (Mrs.) Vijay Laxmi Saxena, Former Head of the Department of Zoology, Dayanand Girls P.G. College, Kanpur (U.P.)
- (ix) Dr. Rajiva Kumar Singh, Professor, Department of Physiology, Patna Medical College, Bihar.
- (x) Dr. Surya Kant, Professor and HoD, Department of Respiratory Medicine, King George Medical University, Lucknow.
- (xi) Dr. Subrata Sinha, Professor and HoD, Department of Biochemistry, AIIMS, New Delhi.
- (xii) Dr. P. K. Singh, Director, AIIMS Patna (Ex-officio)

No response were received from the following members:

- (i) Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal, Member of Parliament, Hon'ble MP, Lok Sabha
- (ii) Shri Rajesh Bhushan, Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi or his/her nominee (ex-officio)
- (iii) Dr. Dharmendra S. Gangwar, Additional Secretary & Financial Advisor, MoHFW, GoI (ex-officio)
- (iv) Prof. Pramod Kumar Jain, Director, IIT Patna (ex-officio)

As per the response received, the following is the name of elected members for the Governing Body.

ranking 4

Wh

#### As per para (e) above:

(i) Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal, Member of Parliament, Hon'ble MP, Lok Sabha

#### As per para (f) above:

- (i) Shri Deepak Kumar, Chief Secretary, Govt. of Bihar or his/her nominee (ex-officio)
- (ii) Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay, Senior Director and Head, Gastroenterology and Hepatology, Max Super Speciality Hospital, New Delhi.
- (iii) Dr. Vishwambhar Singh, Associate Professor, Department of ENT, IMS, BHU, Varanasi.
- (iv) Dr. Rajiva Kumar Singh, Professor, Department of Physiology, Patna Medical College, Bihar.
- (v) Dr. Surya Kant, Professor and HoD, Department of Respiratory Medicine, King George Medical University, Lucknow.
- (vi) Dr. Subrata Sinha, Professor and HoD, Department of Biochemistry, AIIMS, New Delhi.

#### Discussion:

**Director, AIIMS Patna** put a request that as far as constitution of Governing Body is considered, the Secretary Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is not being represented in the names proposed. The Director informed that the Secretary Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has a very important role and requested to consider to include his name in Governing Body, as it will be very good for the Institute as well as functioning of the Governing Body. The Director also informed that it will make it easy for the Institute to get implemented whatever decision are taken by the Governing Body.

**Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal** said that there is already Additional or Joint Secretary from the Government of India who will be a member of the Governing Body. Moreover he was of the view that the scheme of the constitution of the Governing Body was framed by Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and they should have put the Secretary as the permanent member.

**Shri Nilambuj Sharan**, *Joint Secretary*, informed the Institute Body that the power to constitute the Governing Body is with the Institute Body and it is only in the interest of the functioning of the Institute to have Secretary in the Governing Body.

Nutus

**Shri Dharmendra S. Gangwar** informed that, he as Additional Secretary and Financial Advisor, is representing the Ministry of Finance in Institute Body and Governing Body. Hence, he informed that if secretary Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is not included in the Governing Body, the Ministry portion will go unrepresented which is not in the interest of the Institute.

It was also informed by the *DDA* that members of the Governing Body are to be selected from members of the Institute Body and not from the permanent representatives.

**Dr. Subrata Sinha,** whose name was proposed in the Agenda, volunteered to drop out of the membership of the Governing Body.

#### **Decision:**

The Governing Body approved inclusion of the name of the Secretary Ministry of Health and Family Welfare as ex-officio member instead of Dr. Subrata Sinha. Accordingly, Constitution of Governing Boyd of AIIMS Patna with one chairman, 7 elected members, 2 ex-officio members and Director of the Institute as member Secretary, as proposed is approved. There will be five Permanent Special Invitees to the GB.

## Agenda Item No.IB-5/04/2020:

## Constitution of the Standing Finance Committee

The Section-10 (5) of the AIIMS Act, 1956 has provided that "subject to such control and restriction as may be prescribed by rules, the Institute may constitute as many Standing Committees and as many ad-hoc committees as it thinks fit for exercising any power or discharging any function of the Institute or for inquiring into or reporting or advising upon any matter which the Institute may refer to them". Annexure-I (Pg. 4)

The Rule-6 of the AIIMS Rules, 2019 has provided that "there shall be constituted a Standing Finance Committee which shall include members representing the Ministry of Finance". **Annexure-V (Pg.1)** 

Similarly, Rule-7 (1) of the AIIMS Rules, 2019 has provided that "Every Standing Committee constituted shall be consisting of a Chairman, a Vice Chairman and not more than seven other members. The Director shall be a member and ex-officio Secretary of each such Committee. The Chairman and Vice Chairman and other members of each committee shall be nominated by the Institute".

Annexure-V (Pg. 1)

men 19

W.

The following names are proposed for the Standing Finance Committee:

S. No.	Name/Designated of members of the Institute Body	Present Incumbent	
1.	Secretary, MoHFW, GoI	Shri Rajesh Bhushan	Chairman Ex-officio Member,
2.	Additional Secretary & Financial Advisor, MoH&FW, GoI	Shri Dharmendra S. Gangwar	Vice-Chairman Ex-officio Member, Representative of Ministry of Finance
3.	Director General of Health Services, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India	Dr. Sunil Kumar	Ex-officio Member
4.	Chief Secretary, Government of Bihar or his/her nominee	Shri Deepak Kumar	Ex-officio member
5.	Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay, Senior Director and Head Gastroenterology and Hepatology, Max Super Speciality Hospital, New Delhi		Member
6.	Dr. Vishwambhar Singh, Associate Professor, Department of ENT, IMU, BHU, Varanasi		Member
7.	Prof. Devi Prasad Tiwari, VC, Veer Kunwar Singh University, Ara (Bihar)		Member
8.	Shri Ram Chandra Prasad Singh, Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Rajya Sabha)		Member .
9.	Director of the Institute	Dr. P.K. Singh	Ex-officio, Member- Secretary

### Decision:

Constitution of the Standing Finance Committee with a Chairman, Vice-Chairman, 6 additional members and Director of the Institute as Ex officio Member Secretary as proposed is approved.

MAN 19

MA

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/05/2020:

Constitution of Standing Committees.

As per Gazette of India: Extraordinary – Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Notification dated 26.09.2019 at New Delhi, under GSR 693(E), Clause 7, there shall be Standing Committees with the following guidelines Annexure-V (Pg. 1):

- (1) Every standing committee constituted shall be consisting of a Chairman, a Vice Chairman and not more than seven other members. The Director shall be a member and ex-officio Secretary of each such committee.
- (2) The Chairman and Vice Chairman and other members of each committee shall be nominated by the Institute.
- (3) In particular, there shall be constituted, a Standing Committee to be called the Academic Committee for the purpose of considering the matters specified in section 14 of the Act, another Standing Committee to be called the Estate Committee for the purpose of considering additions and alterations to buildings belonging to the Institute and other questions relating to their maintenance and use and,
- (4) A combined Central or Regional Committee for recruitment of faculty members.
- (5) The term of office of members of a Standing Committee shall be five years. An outgoing member shall be eligible for re-nomination.
- (6) A casual vacancy in a standing committee may be filled by the President by nomination."

#### **Decision:**

- (a). A Standing committee as Academic Committee with Chairman, Vice-Chairman & seven members including Director as Member Secretary as proposed is approved.
- (b). A Standing committee as Estate Committee with Chairman, Vice-Chairman & seven members including Director as Member Secretary as proposed is approved.

Just of the state of the state

## Agenda Item No.IB-5/06/2020:

Constitution of Ad hoc Committee as Standing Selection Committee of the GB

As per Gazette of India: Extraordinary – Ministry of Health and Family Welfare dated 26.09.2019 at New Delhi, under GSR 693(E), Clause 8, there shall be an Ad hoc committee with following guidelines **Annexure-V** (Pg. 2):

- (1) An ad-hoc committee may be constituted by the Institute for such purposes as it may consider necessary.
- (2) The Chairman and members of an ad hoc committee shall be nominated by the Governing Body.
- (3) The term of office of members of ad hoc committee shall be terminated as soon as the specific function for which such committee is constituted is completed.
- (4) Any casual vacancy in an ad hoc committee shall be filled by nomination by the Chairman of the Governing Body.

#### **Decision:**

Constitution of an Ad-hoc Committee as Standing Selection Committee by the Governing Body for conducting interview for Selection of Faculties for AIIMS, Patna for a period of 2 years is approved.

Member of the Committee including Chairman and Vice-chairman are to be nominated by the Governing Body as per Act.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/07/2020:

Constitution of Ad hoc Committee as HR Sub-Committee of the GB

As per Gazette of India: Extraordinary – Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Notification dated 26.09.2019 at New Delhi, under GSR 693(E),

Clause 8, there shall be an Ad hoc committee with following guidelines **Annexure-V (Pg. 2):** 

- (1) An ad-hoc committee may be constituted by the Institute for such purposes as it may consider necessary.
- (2) The Chairman and members of an ad hoc committee shall be nominated by the Governing Body.
- (3) The term of office of members of ad hoc committee shall be terminated as soon as the specific function for which such committee is constituted is completed.
- (4) Any casual vacancy in an ad-hoc committee shall be filled by nomination by the Chairman of the Governing Body."
  - (A) The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Govt. of India vide their letter No. Z-28016/19/2018-PMSSY-IV, dated-23.03.2018 Annexure-VI (Pg.1-2) has communicated the decision to constitute a HR Sub-committee of the Governing Body to consider and approve the recommendation of the Standing Selection Committee (SSC) for empanelment and appointment of Faulty in respective AIIMS. The respective six new AIIMS would require placing the selection and approval of the Sub-committee before the respective Governing Body (GBs) for ratification in due course. As per the letter mentioned a constitution of the Sub-committee was as under:
    - 1. Secretary (H&FW), MOHFW, GOI or his/her representative not below the rank of Joint Secretary dealing with Medical Education in MOHFW, GOI;
    - Chief Secretary of the concerned State or his/her representative not below the rank of Health Secretary of the concerned State dealing with Medical Education in the State; and
    - 3. Director of the concerned AIIMS as Convenor of the Sub-Committee of Governing Body (GB).

However vide letter of even no. dated- 6th July, 2018 HR Sub-Committee of Governing Body of AIIMS Patna was reconstituted Annexure-VII (Pg. 1). The Constitution of the Committee communicated vide letter of ever no. dated 23rd March 2018 was changed.

(B) The Ministry of Health & Family Welfare vide F. No. Z-28016/130/2015-SSH (E.O.3087752), dated- 6th May 2017 intimated for regular appointment of Non- faculty Gr. 'A' post,

rate of

the power to make regular appointment lies with the Governing Body (para-3 of the said order). It is proposed that all such regular appointment to non-faculty Gr. 'A' post will be put up to HR Sub-Committee of the Governing Body to approve the recommendation of the Selection Committee (refer letter Z-28016/24/2014-SSH, dated- 1st May, 2015) for appointment of non-faculty at AIIMS Patna. The Selection and approval of the Sub-committee will be put up for the Governing Body for ratification in due course.

In view of the above, it is proposed to constitute the HR Sub-Committee of the GB comprising of four members of the GB to consider recommendation of the Standing Selection Committee for faculty and non-faculty Group 'A' post which are to be approved by Governing Body as per the delegation of power as issued by the MoH&FW vide their letter No. Z-28016/130/2015-SSH (E. O. 3087752) dated 06.04.2017 and as proposed in B above. **Annexure-VIII (Pg. 1)** 

#### **Decision:**

The Institute Body approves:

- (a) An Ad-hoc Committee as HR Sub Committee of the GB comprising of four members of the GB to consider recommendation of the Standing Selection Committee for appointment of Faculty.
- (b) The HR Sub Committee as referred in (a) above will also consider recommendation of the Selection Committee for appointment of non-faculty Group- 'A' posts.

The report/recommendation of the above Committee mentioned above will be put up to the GB for ratification in due course.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/08/2020:

As per Gazette of India: Notification- Ministry of Health and Family welfare dated 18th October 2019, and in suppression of All India Institute of Medical Sciences Regulations 1999 issued vide F No 14-3/69 (98)/Co-ordination Cell/Estt.(Part-II) Clause-15, procedure of appointment of Dean and Associate Dean has been prescribed, as below.

1. There shall be three Deans, namely, Dean (Academic), Dean (Research) and Dean (Examination). A professor and Head of Department shall be appointed as Dean by the Institute, taking into consideration the seniority, in consultation with the Director.

ration

WIN

- 2. There shall be three Associate Deans, namely, Associate Dean (Academic), Associate Dean (Research), and Associate Dean (Examination). Any faculty (Additional Professor or above) can be appointed as Associate Dean by the Institute in consultation with Director. The Associate Dean (Academic) and Associate Dean (Research) shall be appointed from medical faculty only.
- 3. The tenure of the Dean and Associate Dean shall be for a maximum period of three years and further extendable for one more term by the Institute in consultation with the Director of the Institute.
- 4. The Deans and Associate Deans shall be appointed from existing faculty members and no additional remuneration shall be paid unless as approved from time to time by the Government of India.

The names of the faculty members in cadre of Professor and Additional Professor, as per seniority, is placed at **Annexure-IX** 

**President of the Institute Body, Dr. N. K. Arora** informed that at present Dr. Umesh Kumar Bhadani has been appointed as Dean because the earlier Dean was relieved and hence, the appointment of Dr. Umesh Kumar Bhadani as Dean needs to be ratified. Dr. Umesh Kumar Bhadani is appointed because he being the senior most eligible faculty.

**Director AIIMS, Patna** clarified that at present Dr. Sadhana Sharma, was the senior most but she was non-medical faculty. Hence, Dr. Umesh Kumar Bhadani being the second in seniority was proposed for the post of Dean. And hence, the name of Dr. Umesh Kumar Bhadani needs to ratified by the Institute Body.

**Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal** said that it was already decided that the Dean and Medical Superintendent have to be from medical fraternity and this decision of the Institute Body was taken 5 years back. He also raised the question that since it was decided that not to put any non-medical as a Dean or Medical Superintendent, so why is the question arising here. He also questioned why Associate Dean Examination is to be from non-medical.

The *President* **Dr. N. K. Arora** informed that this is as per the provision of the Act that Associate Dean, Academic and Research shall be appointed from medical and for Associate Dean Examination, both medical and Non-medical can be considered.

**Dr. N. K. Arora**, *President* directed to the document in the minutes that Dean and Medical Superintendent will be from the medical stream

Associate Dean of Research and Academics will always from the medical field and this will become the guiding process in the times to come.

**Director, AIIMS, Patna** informed that the seniority list of professor and Additional Professor has been attached as **Annexure-IX** and it may select two more Deans in order to seniority.

**Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay** said that when it comes to research and academics, a person who is of similar or less seniority but has done excellent work in Academics or Research should be considered so as to give importance to merit or shall it be just on the basis of seniority.

**Shri Nilambuj Sharan**, *Joint Secretary* informed that seniority is not the absolute criteria and that from the first three four in merit, we could actually choose based on their research so that particularly in terms of research there should be preference to somebody who has actual track record and has some good research background.

**Dr. N. K. Arora,** *President* suggested that amongst the Senior faculty, a research team should be formed on the basis of persons who have better research track record. Among them, seniority will make a difference but we should look at the CV and if the IB agrees, and allows the President, who can look at Bio-data and CV and research record, and see who has a better track record.

It was finally decided that Director will give names of 5-6 senior members in order of seniority for consideration except for Dean Academics which is already approved to the President, and as per their credentials Dean and Associate Dean will be decided.

#### Decision:

Director AIIMS, Patna will give names of 5-6 senior members according to the seniority list to President Institute Body, and as per their credential, Dean Research and Dean Examination, and Associate Dean Academic, Research & Examination will be decided by the President.

For Dean Academic, name of *Shri Umesh Kumar Bhadani* is approved for 3 years from the date of his having assumed the charge order for appointment of Dean approved by the President is approved ex-post facto.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/09/2020

Direction of the MoHFW

1. Letter No 28016/164/2020-PMSSY-IV dated 16.10.2020 for bringing before the IB the issues raised by Dr Sanjay Jaiswal, Hon'ble Member of Parliament (enclosed with the letter) (Annexure-X)

2. D.O No: C-17011/182020-PMSSY-IV dated 6<sup>th</sup> October 2020 from Shri Sunil Sharma, Joint Secretary, PMSSY, MoHFW, GoI regarding assignment of charge of the post of MS at AIIMS Patna (Annexure- XI)

#### Reference:

- (a) Letter No 28016/164/2020-PMSSY-IV dated 16.10.2020 from MoHFW PMSSY Division Annexure- X
  - (b) Letter No DEL 1105 dated 15/03/2020 from Dr Sanjay Jaiswal, Hon'ble Member of Parliament **Annexure-XII**
  - D.O No: C-17011/182020-PMSSY-IV, dated 6<sup>th</sup> October 2020 from Shri Sunil Sharma, Joint Secretary, PMSSY, MoHFW, GoI. Annexure- XI
  - Parawise comment on the letter at (b) above is offered at <u>Annexure-XIII</u>
  - Comment on the letter at (b) above is offered at Annexure- XIV
  - It is also to bring to the notice of the Members of the Institute Body that a letter was written by Director, AIIMS Patna with approval of the President, Institute Body to Joint Secretary, PMSSY and Additional Secretary and Financial Advisor, MoHFW for Forensic and Special Audit of AIIMS Patna for the period 2013-14 to 2016-17 vide letter no. F-17365, dated 03.10.2020 Annexure-XV

An Audit Team of the Internal Audit Party, Kolkata of MoHFW carried out the Audit at AIIMS Patna from 27.10.2020 to 12.11.2020. Their report is awaited.

• As per the direction given in letter no. Z-28016/131/2014-SSH dated- 21<sup>st</sup> June, 2019 from Shri Sanjay Roy, Director, MoHFW, New Delhi, the President of Institute Body constituted a Committee vide his letter no. IEO-Delhi/GEN-Corres2020/INC-256 dated- 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2020 nominating Dr. N. R. Biswas, Director, IGIMS Patna and Dr. Saurabh Varshney, Executive Director, AIIMS Deoghar for providing opportunity of personal hearing to the 5 aggrieved faculty members whose name figure in High Level Committee Report (Refer Annexure- XVI). The Committee met on 20<sup>th</sup> October, 2020 and after providing opportunity of

Personal Hearing, submission of documents and written representation by them submitted their report which is placed at **Annexure-XVII.** 

Report of the Committee is placed before the Institute Body as per direction contained in letter no. Z-28016/131/2014-SSH dated- 21<sup>st</sup> June, 2019 (Annexure- XII F) and the report of High Level Committee is put up as per direction contained in letter no. IEO-Delhi/GEN-Corres2020/INC-256 dated- 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2020 (Annexure- XVII)

**Dr. P. K. Singh**, *Director of the Institute* informed that two letters was received from the Ministry, one was letter written by Dr. **Sanjay Jaiswal**, *Hon'ble Member of Parliament* to Minister of Health and Family Welfare which was directed to the Institute to be put before the Institute Body. This letter contained observations and the point wise reply as available is put up in response to the questions asked. This is available at **Annexure-XIII** of the agenda.

Out of this Point no: 11 is very important point and refers that no action has been taken on the Arya Committee report. Thereafter the Director informed the members of the Institute Body the facts related to the inquiry and briefed about the appointment of Arya Committee and High Level Committee and the discussion about it in the previous Institute Body meeting. Director, AIIMS, Patna Dr. P. K. Singh formally informed that now the whole issue is before the Institute Body and first of all Institute Body has to take the decision regarding all those faculty appointment where no irregularity was observed by the High Level Committee. High Level Committee observed the irregularity in appointment of 5 faculty members only. Committee appointed by the President as per the direction of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare further examined the issue of these 5 faculty members on personnel hearing and cleared no irregularity the name of two faculty members. The Director AIIMS, Patna summarised as above the details and thereafter requested the Institute Body to consider for taking appropriate decision as per the facts mentioned above.

**Dr. Rajesh Updhayay** said that it is now left for decision of the three faculty members as mentioned above by Director that he has left the decision of three people in the final round and not cleared in all the process carried on till now.

**Shri Sanjay Jaiswal**, Hon'ble Member of Parliament said that since last 8 years we have been prolonging it intentionally or unintentionally and now, 8 years has happened and somebody has

mit no

Will

to fix its responsibility. IB should not decide whom to keep and whom to sack as it is absolute prerogative of the Director and if something has been wrong doing he (Director) has to decide. He also said that if you (IB) take decisions then after some time we may be in problem because there are so many instances where a group takes the decision collectively and after some time if something happens the group has to take responsibility collectively. So he was of the view to let the Director decide and refer this whole matter to the CVC and let them fix responsibility.

Director AIIMS, Patna Dr. P. K. Singh informed that the Appointing Authority of all faculty member is the Governing Body, so as per rules, authority rests with the Governing Body as far as appointments are concerned. Accordingly, it is up to the IB to decide.

Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal, Hon'ble Member of Parliament Said that all responsibility lies in GB who has not seen the credentials of these people, he also said that now that all the wrong doings has been done by the GB so he said it was a sincere request that the case should be forwarded to the CVC and they will fix the responsibility thereafter he said "I will leave on you all to decide, I have recorded my statement that it should go to CVC and the responsibility should be fixed to those people who are prolonging in the Institute". AIIMS Bhubaneswar and Rishikesh took action 6 years back while at AIIMS Patna no action has been taken. So this is my submission and with this I have been fighting since last 7 years and I am leaving this meeting and let the IB decide."

**Dr. Rajesh Upadhyay** said he was certainly against for any other agency for any further inquiry. It was 8 years and it is enough and after all career of these people is in doldrums. He said that details of these three people should be circulated among us and a decision may be taken by the Director and Governing Body.

He was also of the view as part of the Institute Body, we should not shy away from taking responsibility, and the Director needs the facilitation and the help of the Governing Body and Institute Body for taking certain tough decisions.

President **Dr. N. K. Arora** requested that by 21st January the Governing Body meeting should be held and they should give back their decision to the Institute Body accordingly.

Director **Dr. P. K. Singh** also informed as part of this same agenda that Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal, Hon'ble Member of Parliament had asked for the Forensic Audit in his letter for AIIMS, Patna. Financial audit in this regard is done by a team from Ministry of Health and Family Welfare but no report has been received till date.

e but no report in

**Shri Dharmendra S. Gangwar** informed that he will check up to Chief Controller of Accounts and then inform about it.

- Dr. P. K. Singh, Director, AIIMS, Patna informed about another letter mentioned in the same Agenda from Shri Sunil Sharma, Joint Secretary, PMSSY, MoHFW about the assignment of charge of Medical Superintendent AIIMS, Patna. Director, AIIMS, Patna informed the Institute Body that there was Medical Superintendent in the beginning. But thereafter he could not find a new Medical Superintendent and ad-hoc arrangement had to be done. A present professor of CFM (Community and Family Medicine) has been given charge of Medical Superintendent as he had the experience at his earlier posting as Medical Superintendent. Also I have given him four Deputy Medical Superintendents to support him for carrying out different functions of the hospital. Moreover, three advertisements have been issued calling for application for the post on deputation basis but no suitable candidate have applied.
- **Dr. N. K. Arora,** *President* gave a suggestion for the Institute Body that AIIMS, Patna should establish a Department of Medical Hospital Administration (MHA). Because unless there is Hospital Administration, it is very difficult to get as Medical Superintendent as we are struggling for last ten or twelve years that we have not got a regular MS. This will also help in capacity building and new degree programme can be established.
- **Dr. P. K. Singh**, *Director*, *AIIMS*, *Patna* informed that this proposal will be taken to the Academic Committee and then taken to the GB and IB because the posts are to be sanctioned. The post of Medical Superintendent and Deputy Medical Superintendent is non-faculty posts and their salary structure is less than faculty.
- **Dr. N. K. Arora**, *President* asked to initiate for setting of Medical Hospital Administration Department even if it takes 5 to 6 years because in longs terms sustainability should not hampered.
- **Shri Chhedi Paswan** *Member of Parliament* raised the issue referring Shri Bheem Prasad that he has won the case from the High Court and thereafter why he has been barred from holding office. It was informed that this fact was brought to the notice to the Ministry and thereafter Ministry has gone to the Supreme Court and the Special Leave Petition to the Supreme Court has been filed.

#### Decision:

 A decision regarding the recommendation of the High Powered Committee will be taken by Governing Body, and the Governing Body will give back its decision to Institute Body. Director, AIIMS, Patna will send documents related to the High Powered

Manta 4

V

Committee & Other connected documents to all members of the IB. A meeting of the Governing Body should be held before 21<sup>st</sup> January 2021.

2. Process should be initiated for establishing a Department of Hospital Administration as a Separate Department at AIIMS, Patna.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/10/2020:

As per Ministry of Health and Family Welfare letter number: Z-28016/83/2015-SSH from MoH&FW dated: 28.06.2018 **Annexure-XVIII** 

"A decision taken by the Central Institute Body may be adopted by the new AIIMS and same may be ratified by their respective GBs and IBs in due course".

Minutes of Meeting of the 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Central Institute Body held at 3:00 PM on 27 July 2019 was circulated vide letter number: F-5/2/2019/Gen (CIB-4), dated: 28 October 2019 from All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi **Annexure-XIX** 

Item number CIB 4/5: Measure to improve faculty strength in New AIIMS was discussed and is reproduced below

## Item number CIB 4/5: Measures to improve faculty strength in New AIIMS.

After detailed deliberations, the following decisions were taken by CIB

- A. Down-gradating of the posts of Additional/Associate Professor to the level of Assistant Professor may be carried out for a fixed period by the AIIMS with the approval of their respective Governing Body. The post of Professor may not be downgraded as it is essential to have professor for conduct of Post Graduate course in the AIIMS.
- B. With regard to the proposal of temporary diversion of posts from one Department to another Department, Additional Secretary informed that the proposal would disturb the proposed standard staffing pattern. It was decided that temporary diversion may be done on loan basis for faculty which may be filled up on "contractual appointment" while keeping in mind the HR provisions in the standard staffing pattern.

ration

Wh

- C. With regard to relaxation of essential teaching/research experience, it was decided that relaxation of one year for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes may be given as per Rules/Guidelines issued by DoP&T.
- D. It was decided that running advertisement with one-year validity may be adopted to expedite the recruitment of faculty after which fresh running or normal advertisement may be issued again depending upon faculty strength. In the one year Running Advertisement, short advertisement or web site notices may be issued several times as may be required, depending upon actual progress of recruitment, with clear mention of cut off dates for submission of application and eligibility, each time.
- E. With regard to Centralised Recruitment body, Additional Secretary informed that such alternative provision has been made in the amended AIIMS Regulations which are under process for notification and same should be adopted by the new AIIMS along with the standalone recruitment exercises at each Institute level. The CIB approved the proposal.

#### Decision:

The Agenda item of the CIB is ratified by the Institute Body. Moreover, the power to downgrade the post is authorised to the President of the Institute Body.

## Agenda Item No. IB-5/11/2020:

The proposal as brought in agenda item is approved expressing gratitude to the outgoing members of the Institute Body. A momento and a letter of gratitude be sent to all the outgoing members of the Institute Body. The President thanked everybody for appearing and sharing their valuable time at the Institute Body.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the chair.

Ment of

Wh.